Analysis of search space in the domain of swarm intelligence

Vaishli P. Patel¹, Dr. Manoj Kumar Rawat², and Amit S. Patel³

¹ Department of Computer Engineering, Oriental University, Indore, Madhya Pradesh, India ² Department of Computer Engineering, Oriental University, Indore, Madhya Pradesh, India ³ Department of Mechanical Engineering, Dharmsinh Desai University, Nadiad, Gujarat, India vaishalipatel02@yahoo.com, drmkrawat@gmail.com aspatel.mh@ddu.ac.in

Abstract. The formulation and analysis of complex problems to get optimum solution is an emerging art which inspired new perspective in optimization world. Derived from biological system swarm intelligence algorithm attract many researcher due to its simplicity and adaptable nature with real life problem. But swarm algorithms suffer from its search process. Higher rate of exploitation may trap to pre-mature solution and higher rate of exploration slow down the process or may not true solution. In this paper we present detailed analysis and sorting of search strategies based on its property and structure to get optimum of exploration and exploitation for swarm algorithms. In our study we cluster majority of strategies in to information sharing and change in structure. In first part sharing of information is categorized by population initialization, population update and population control. In second part change in structure is categorized by modification in governing equation, hybridization and new topology. At last the analysis attempts to provide understanding for different strategies, current issues and future research for expert and researcher.

Keywords: Swarm intelligence, Exploration, Exploitation.

1 Introduction

Bio inspired algorithm which are replication of evolution and foraging pattern of different living entity exist on the world are broadly classified in two sub field: Evolutionary and swarm based algorithm.

Evolutionary algorithms are derived from the theory of survive in nature by increased population, progress, companion, mate selection and breeding. Genetic Algorithm, Differential Evolution, Evolution strategy are few among them.

Swarm algorithms are inspired from foraging process which exhibit social and cognitive behavior, decentralize and self-organized pattern of swarm. Particle swarm optimizer, artificial bee colony algorithm, glowworm swarm algorithm, firefly algorithm, cuckoo search algorithm, bat algorithm, grey wolf optimizer, Spider Monkey Optimization are the algorithms following swarm approach.

2 Complexity of Search Space in swarm intelligence

When meta heuristic algorithms are applied they surrounded with huge amount of data may be neighbor or far unknown region. And both data should be effectively analyzed to get optimum solution. It is also known as exploitation and exploration respectively. Higher rate of exploitation may converge process faster or pre-mature solution and lack of global solution. Higher rate of exploration slow down the process or may not true solution. Therefore it is important to find the technique which balance between local and global search process.

Whole search space is not homogeneous in terms of shape, distribution, dimension and property. It may be very with time or distance. It is difficult to optimize exploration and exploitation and get better solution. In last few decade many algorithms are developed to solve mention problem. Each have different initialization, governing equation, update strategy, fitness evaluation etc.

3 Literature Analysis



Fig. 1. Graphical depiction of sorting process for search strategies

After study of many research articles in this work we produced compressive review of search space analysis in swarm intelligence.

Fig.1 shows the general strategies for optimization between exploration and exploitation. It is done either by structure modification or information exchange. In information exchange it is further divided based on which strategy is applied: population distribution, update or control. Algorithm structure can be modified by updating governing equation, hybridization with new algorithm or with new topology.

3.1 Information Sharing

Swarm population is dynamic in nature to find better food source, mates, pray or for mutual communication. During this behavior they share information locally or globally. In another words solution search space is updated with new data and characteristic with time and space which is decentralized in nature. In this work we document the algorithms which utilized different sharing mechanism to optimize the local and global information. Based on analysis we divided the sharing mechanism in to population generation, updates and control

Population generation

In swarm intelligent based algorithm initial population play major role in optimum solution. Because of insufficient data, less diversification, randomness and non-uniform distribution of population may cause the solution to be struck premature convergence or fully diverge and may be no solution. In this section we present different mechanism for better population generation.

Autors/Years	Algorithm	Method to generate initial population
Fengli Zhou[1]	PSO-DE-	New positions are created surrounding the random
	GABC	particle to improve divergence and global best to im-
		prove convergence.
Om Prakash	Firefly	To improve convergence rate opposition based learning
Verma[2]	algorithm	is used during initialization. Position of each candidate
		is updated in different dimensions by dimension based
		approach.
Dipayan Guha	Grey wolf	Quasi opposition based learning theory.
[3]	optimization	
Yugal kumar[4]	ABC	K-means algorithm.
Parham	ABC	Logistic maps
Moradi[5]		
Dongping Tian	PSO	Logistic maps
[6]		
Wang	ABC	Good point set theory.
ChunFeng[7]		
Ali Asghar Hei-	GWO	Oppositional based learning
dari[8]		
Zhiyu Zhou[9]	GWO	Differential evolution algorithm
Rehab AliIbra-	GWO	Chaotic logistic map and the opposition based learning
him[10]		
Xiaolian Liu[11]	GWO	Inverse Parabolic Spread Distribution

Table 1. Summary of methods to generate initial population

Population update

Due to dynamic nature of swarm new information (position, fitness, local or global best) is generated with best or worst solution. But it is meaningless until we not get right information at the right time. In literature researcher proposed varieties of strate-

gies to utilize right data at right time to come out from local convergence or to explore global optimum. According to our finding we divide update rule in further four sub class: Population attribute, Grouping, Selection scheme and Evolutionary algorithm (EA) operators.

Population attribute

In this part best or worst information available from personal, neighbor, historical or new data is shared with other candidate to find optimum solution.

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Attribute
Tran Dang Cong[12]	ABC	Use current, global and random property of data.
Chao Gan[13]	BA	Local search will be disturbed to find global best
Zhennao Cai [14]	GWO	Random local search and random global search
Yongquan Zhou[15]	Monkey algorithm	Cooperation process
Qiang Tu [16]	GWO	Global-best around the current best solution and Coop- erative strategy
Vijay Kumar[17]	GWO	The each grey wolf learn from movement of sun
LongWen[18]	GWO	Personal historical best position and the global best position.
Ran Cheng[19]	PSO	Use any better particles in the current swarm instead of historical best.
Anping Lin[20]	PSO	Cooperative archive
Eman Saad [21]	ABC	Use previous knowledge gained by predecessor
Hema Banati[22]	BA	Best neighbour.
Longwang Yue[23]	Ant colony	Penalty strategy based on worst solution
Mohammed A.	ABC	Fittest food sources
Awadallah[24]		
Selcuk Aslan[25]	ABC	Nondeterministic behaviours of the employed bees.
Hong-Jun Wang [26]	Ant Colony Algorithm	Property of best ant and the worst ant
M.K.A. Ariyaratne	Firefly	Determine poor iterations to improve the exploration
[27]	algorithm	property.
Znang[28]	algorithm	tractive search process. To avoid worst solution evad- ing mechanism is used
LijinWang[29]	Cuckoo search	Apply solution-based and a fitness-based similar met- rics to find the nearest neighbour solutions which is used to generate new solution.
Rahib H. Abiyev [30]	Monkey algorithm	One and all component perturbation process
MoumitaPradhan[31]	Grey wolf optimization	Property of hunting behaviour and social hierarchy
Hailun Xie[32]	Firefly	Property of high similarity of firefly and relocation in
	Algorithms	different direction
Mingfu He [33]	PSO	Cooperation mechanism
Wen Long[34]	GWO	Property of random individual

 Table 2. Summary of attribute

Table 3. Summary of attribute

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Attribute
Rohit Salgotra[35]	Cuckoo search algo-	Division of population and division of generations.
0	rithms	
Manju Sharma[36]	PSO	Statistical property of dataset is used for velocity limits
R.Murugan[37]	Bat algo- rithm with artificialbee colony	Property of individual's directional information, habitat selection and self-adaptive compensation.
Fadl Dahan[38]	ACO	Quality of the rest of the solutions.
Abhijit	Firefly	Short term memory in terms of last location and light
Banerjee[39]	algorithm	intensity
Supriya Dhabal [40]	Cuckoo Search	Global best solution is used to replace old one
[]	Algorithm	
Mengchu	Firefly	Property of optimal firefly used to improve others
11an[41]	algorithm	
R.Murugan [37]	Bat algo- rithm with ABC	Aging level of the individual's best solution.
Divya Kumar K.K. Mishra[42]	ABC	Property of covariance information

Population Grouping

In this part whole population is divided in to number of subgroup based on different criteria and each sub group has same property. Information extracted from each group is used for future improvement of the solution.

Table 4	I.	Summary	of	orouning	criteria	a
I abit	•	Summary	or	grouping	cincin	4

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Grouping Criteria
Eman Saad [21]	CB-ABC	Best solution from history and self-adaptive information
Laizhong Cui	ABC	Convergence and diversion population
[43]		
Xifan Yao [44]	IDABC	Based on value of fitness function
Avinash Sharma	Ageist Spi-	Levels of ability to interact and to track changes in the
[45]	der Monkey	environment
	Optimization	

Selection Scheme

Selection scheme is the tool to balance between exploration by promoting random unknown region and exploitation by selecting better individual. In this section we explain different selection scheme proposed in literature.

Table 5. Summary of selection criteria

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Selection Scheme
Ahmet Babalik [46]	ABC	Utilize objective values instead of fitness value in greedy selection process
Changsheng[47]	ABC	Replace greedy selection process with Deb's constrained handling method
Subhodip Biswas [48]	ABC	Greedy scheme of positional perturbation
Xiaojing Li[49]	ACO	Node random selection mechanism
Mohammed Azmi Al- Betar[50]	Bat Algo- rithms	Six selection mechanisms global best, proportional, expo- nential, random, linear and tournament rank
Ali Asghar Hei- dari [8]	Grey wolf	Greedy selection mechanisms
Mohammed A. Awadallah [24]	ABC	Four selection schemes: global-best, exponential, tourna- ment and linear rank
BinWu [51]	Glow worm	Greedy selection mechanisms
Ammar Mansoor Kamoona[52]	Cuckoo search	Greedy selection mechanisms

EA Operators

To optimize local and global search process EA algorithm use crossover and mutation operators. Crossover operator swaps the part of data string with other and mix final solution to enhance exploitation. Mutation change part of data string randomly to enhance diversity or exploration. In literature researchers propose variety of EA operators and its modification to find optimum result, following table show the brief review of EA operators used in bio inspired algorithm.

Table 6. 3	Summary	of EA	Operators
------------	---------	-------	-----------

Year/Authors	Algorithm	EA Operators
LijinWang [29]	Cuckoo search	Probabilistic mutation strategy
D. Tian [53]	PSO	Gaussian mutation strategies
Guoqiang Liu	PSO	Gaussian chaotic mutation operators.
[54]		
Xiaohui Yan [55]	ABC	Crossover operator
Manju Sharma	PSO	Mutation operator
[36]		
Manju Sharma	PSO	Polygamous crossover operator. Parameters of cross over
[56]		operator are updated dynamically.

Table 7. Summary of EA Operators

Year/Authors	Algorithm	EA Operators
YanXia [57]	PSO	Probabilistic mutation operator is applied on historical best
		position.
Hossein Shari-	ACO	Gaussian mutation with (1+1) ES algorithm
fipour [58]		
Leila Eskandari	ACO	Mutation of the global best and personal best of each
[23]		solution.
Shilei Lyu[59]	Bat Algo-	Mutation mechanism with loudness parameter to control
	rithm	local and global search
Mengchu Tian	Firefly	Adaptive mutation
[41]	algorithm	
Asma M. Alta-	Firefly	Partially matched crossover operator (PMX). Two muta-
beeb [60]	algorithm	tion strategies are applied based on random selection and
		swapping.
Judhisthir Dash	Cuckoo	Mutation operator of differential evolution technique.
[61]	Search	
Min Cao[62]	ACO	Roulette wheel algorithm of genetic algorithm

Population control

To balance exploration and exploitation researcher introduced control parameter which regulate the search process in different phases. In this section we list some of the parameter strategy to control the search process.

 Table 8. Summary of control strategy

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Control Strategies
Shin Siang	ABC	Modified Choice Function: Weight of the exploration and
Choong[63]		exploitation is adaptively control during different phase of search process.
Mingfu He [33]	PSO	Damping factor: The least optimal solution from history is decided to drop or reinitialized.
Ahmet Babalik [46]	ABC	Modification rate: To change more than one parameter during update phase.
Hailun Xie [32]	Firefly Algorithms	Attractiveness coefficient is replaced with a randomized control matrix
Wen Long[34]	Grey wolf	Nonlinear control parameter strategy.
Akash Saxena [64]	Grey Wolf Optimizer	Search process is governed by truncated sinusoidal func- tion instead of linearly decrease function.
Bo Yang [65]	Cuckoo search	To analyse the current and historical information Speed Factor and Aggregation factor are used, further to effec- tively utilize this information scale conversion factors is used.
Hojjat Rakhshani [66]	Cuckoo search	Reinforcement learning to swap between snap (global search) and drift modes (local search).
M.A.H. Akhand [67]	Spider Monkey	Swap Sequence and Swap Operators based operations

Table 9. Summary of control strategy

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Control Strategies
Chao Gan[13]	Bat algo-	Stochastic inertia weight: Property of random variable is
	rithm	used to update inertia weight.
		Pulse rate: optimize local and global search
		Loudness: acceptance or rejection of a new solution
Oiang Tu[16]	Grey wolf	Dispersion rate: Which have self-adjusting property to
	5	govern population from early stage of iteration (local
		search) with increased number of iteration (Global search)
Vijav Kumar[17]	Grev wolf	Prev weight: To change parameter dynamically.
<u> </u>	algorithm	Astrophysics strategy: To change movement of population
	0	in elliptical orbit.
LongWen[18]	GWO	Nonlinear adjustment strategy
Anning Lin[20]		The comprehensive learning probability is updated dy-
h8 m.[=0]	PSO	namically by quality of solution.
Hema Banati [22]	Bat Algo-	Step size: More precise steps
	rithm	Search weight factor: To control step size with progression
	1111111	of algorithm.
Dongning	PSO	The sigmoid-based acceleration coefficients with
Tian[53]	150	Slowly varying and regular varying function
Oi Lin[68]	Bat algo-	Time factor: A non-linear decreasing function depends on
QI LIU[00]	rithm	iterations
Maniu	PSO	Inertia weight is updated by some constant value
Sharma[36]	150	morale worght is updated by some constant value
YanXia[57]	PSO	Simplex neighbourhood search strategy
Shilei I yu[59]	Bat Algo-	Step-control mechanism: Count effect of individual and
Sinci Lyu[37]	rithm	group Further adaptively change with group fitness and
	mini	iterations
Mengchu	Firefly	Ontimal firefly strategy: Affect movements of other fire-
Tian[41]	algorithm	flies
M R Ramli [69]	Rat Algo-	Dynamic dimension size
M.R. Rahm [07]	rithm	Dynamic amension size
Kaining Luo [70]	Gorey wolf	Modified weight-based formula: Used to dynamically
Ruping Euo [70]	ontimizer	estimate the location
Gulnur [71]	Bat Algo-	Weight coefficient: To minimize effect of best position in
	rithm	new solution
Min Cao [62]		Simulation experiment : To find optimal parameter
Abhiiit	Firefly	Adaptive mechanism to undate parameter based on itera-
Baneriee[39]	algorithm	tion and intensity of solution
Supriva	Cuckoo	Levy's distribution undated as function of current and
Dhahal[40]	Search	maximum iteration
Sandeen	Spider	Parameter perturbation rate is updated exponentially in
Kumar[72]	monkey	nlace of linearly
Xiaolian Liu[11]	GWO	Dynamic parameter update: Function of lower and upper
	0110	limit of solution
Shubbendu Ku-	Cuckoo	Step size undate: function of current fitness value
mar Sarangi[73]	search	step size update. function of cuttent functs value
Manoi Kumar-	Cuckoo	Sten size undate: function of fitness value and current
Naik[74]	search	nosition
Shubham	GWO	Random walk: Cauchy distribution is used to draw step
Gunta[75]	0.00	size

3.2 Change in structure

In previous discussion we present information sharing to improve search process but there are other ways to improve search process by modified governing equation, hybridize with new algorithm or implementing new topology.

Modified governing equation

Each algorithm has different governing equation with different mathematical property. Which can be further improved by introducing new parameter, merge with other formula or by adding new mathematical steps. In this section we introduced the work done in the equation modification.

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Equation Modification
Guopu Zhu[76]	PSO	ABC equation is modified by global best from PSO
Tarun Kumar	ABC	ABC equation is modified by the local and global best
Sharma[77]		from PSO
Nafiseh Imanian	ABC	New solution derived from global, local best and velocity
[78]		equation of PSO
Zakaria N. Alqat-	ABC	Velocity equation of PSO is embedded with onlooker
tan[79]		phase
XuChen [80]	ABC	ABC updated with Fireworks explosion search
M.R. Ramli[69]	Bat Algo-	Velocity equation is enhanced by inertia weight which is
	rithm	function of velocity and speed.
BinWu[51]	glow worm	ABC and PSO are combined to developed new movement
	swarm	formula.
Aref Yelghi[81]	firefly algo-	Firefly attractiveness is replaced with tidal Force formula
	rithm	
Prabhat R.Singh	Monkey	Local leader phase is modified by the Nelder-Mead
[82]	Optimization	method.
Ali Asghar Hei-	grey wolf	Equation of motion is modified by levy flight which is
dari [8]	optimizer	function of random decreasing stability index
Anping Lin[83]	PSO	PSO search equation is combined with global learning
		component with linearly updated control parameters with
		function of acceleration coefficient and inertia weight.

Table 10. Summary of Modified governing equation

Hybridization

This section discusses hybridization approaches for solving limitation of search process. Typically, the hybrid algorithm borrowed structures from the other natureinspired algorithms or Imitating biological organism or physical system. The hybridization of algorithms combine strength and lessen their limitation.

Hybridize with new algorithm

Table 11. Summary of Hybridization

Year/AuthorsAlgorithmHybridizationMohammed El- Abd[84]ABC-SPSOComponent-based: PSO is combined with ABC compo- nent to enhance personal best.N.Baktash[85]PSABCFitness value of ABC is optimized by PSOOğuz Altun[86]PSO-ABCTwo Phases: ABC and PSO are used to find personal best.L.N. Vitorino[87]Adaptive Bee and PSOABC is perform when PSO trap to convergence Bee and PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]ColonySearch-Bat AlgorithmMbCuckooSearch-Bat AlgorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase and simulat- ed annealingVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Firefly and Firefly and FireflyCondition based: If particle fitness is inprove it is handled by FA.			
Mohammed El- Abd[84]ABC-SPSOComponent-based: PSO is combined with ABC compo- nent to enhance personal best.N.Baktash[85]PSABCFittess value of ABC is optimize by PSOOğuz Altun[86]PSO-ABCTwo Phases: ABC and PSO are used to find personal best.L.N. Vitorino[87]Adaptive Bee and PSOABC is perform when PSO trap to convergence Bee and PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.Crow Relay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]Search-Ant ColonyMbCuckoo Search-Bat AlgorithmMbCuckoo Search-Bat ABCMurugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and Berkan[97]PSOArtificial PArameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and erefly ant by FA.Victor Yepes[98]Artificial PArameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants	Year/Authors	Algorithm	Hybridization
Abd[84]nent to enhance personal best.N.Baktash[85]PSABCFitness value of ABC is optimize by PSOOğuz Altun[86]PSO-ABCTwo Phases: ABC and PSO are used to find personal best.L.N. Vitorino[87]Adaptive Bee and PSOABC is perform when PSO trap to convergence Bee and PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali BouyerICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function. dev[94] rithmMbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmMbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with and simulat- ed annealingVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and PSOVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and Firefly and berkan[97]Psoby FA otherwise by PSO.	Mohammed El-	ABC-SPSO	Component-based: PSO is combined with ABC compo-
N.Baktash[85]PSABCFitness value of ABC is optimize by PSOOğuz Altun[86]PSO-ABCTwo Phases: ABC and PSO are used to find personal best. Parameters are optimized by Cuckoo Search.L.N. Vitorino[87]Adaptive Bee and PSOABC is perform when PSO trap to convergence Bee and PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.Crow Relay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]ColonyMbCuckoo Local output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmMbCuckoo ABCSaraswathi[95]Search-Bat AlgorithmAlgorithm mtRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlocker bee and the last is scout bee phase and simulat- ed annealingVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and PSOVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and Firefly and brenkan[97]PataPSOMaría-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and <br< td=""><td>Abd[84]</td><td></td><td>nent to enhance personal best.</td></br<>	Abd[84]		nent to enhance personal best.
Oğuz Altun[86] Oğuz Altun[86]PSO-ABC Chain Parameters are optimized by Cuckoo Search.L.N. Vitorin0[87]Adaptive Bee and PSOABC is perform when PSO trap to convergence Bee and PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABC PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHM fireflyCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90] Vinita Jindal[91]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91] OptimizationCrow found as global best.Comparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.Crow Relay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93] MBbBat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo JagorithmLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase and simulat- ed annealingVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled PSOVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled Parameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and by FA. </td <td>N.Baktash[85]</td> <td>PSABC</td> <td>Fitness value of ABC is optimize by PSO</td>	N.Baktash[85]	PSABC	Fitness value of ABC is optimize by PSO
Chain L.N. Vitorino[87]Chain Adaptive Bee and PSOParameters are optimized by Cuckoo Search. ABC is perform when PSO trap to convergence Bee and PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum. Combined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO. Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Att Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.Crow Relay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- Ant and Bee Search-Ant colonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function. Local output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmMbCuckoo Local output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat saraswathi[95]Saraswathi[95]Search-Bat algorithmABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial Artificial ant sand by FA.	Oğuz Altun[86]	PSO-ABC	Two Phases: ABC and PSO are used to find personal best.
L.N. Vitorino[87]Adaptive Bee and PSOABC is perform when PSO trap to convergenceZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.Crow ColonyRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function. ColonyMbCuckoo Local output of Cuckoo search algorithm algorithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo ABCLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution. AlgorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA. ferefliceDrahimFirefly and condition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA.		Chain	Parameters are optimized by Cuckoo Search.
Bee and PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.dev[93]ColonyTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with and simulat- ed annealingRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA. firefly and portaneters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and by FA.	L.N. Vitorino[87]	Adaptive	ABC is perform when PSO trap to convergence
PSOZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali BouyerICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant found as global best.Vinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function. ColonyMbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmMbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with and simulat- ed annealingRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlocker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and SonCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA. firefly and by FA.		Bee and	
ZhiyongLi [88]PSO-ABCLocal search phase of PSO is combined with global search phases in ABC for the global optimum.Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Dhanya[92]Search-Ant ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.dev[93] MessaoudiBat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with and simulat- ed annealingRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and ant si and give fA otherwise by PSO.Parameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and by FA.		PSO	
Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMphases in ABC for the global optimum. Combined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M. Danya[92]Crow Search-Ant ColonyRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function. to another.Mb Saraswathi[95]Cuckoo Search-Bat algorithmLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution. AlgorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with and simulat- ed annealingRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and greyflowCondition based: If particle fitness is tuned ants and by FA.	ZhiyongLi [88]	PSO-ABC	Local search phase of PSO is combined with global search
Asgarali Bouyer [89]ICMPKHMCombined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Dhanya[92]Search-Ant ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.dev[93]ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.dev[93]ColonyTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and by FA.Parameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and by FA.			phases in ABC for the global optimum.
[89]an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through antVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.Crow Search-Ant ColonyRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.MbCuckoo Search-Bat AlgorithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo Search-Bat ABCLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and tredParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.	Asgarali Bouyer	ICMPKHM	Combined K Harmonic Means clustering algorithm with
Rajeev Goel[90]ACO and fireflyThe initial population of firefly is obtain through ant fireflyVinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.MbCuckooSwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithmRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA.brahimFirefly and foreflineParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and forefline	[89]		an improved Cuckoo Search and PSO.
Vinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.MbCuckooSwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithmRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onloker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial and smalaCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is tuned ants and firefly.	Rajeev Goel[90]	ACO and	The initial population of firefly is obtain through ant
Vinita Jindal[91]Ant Particle OptimizationComparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately to find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Dhanya[92]Search-Ant ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.MbColonyTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial and simulationParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and by FA.	5 1 1	firefly	
Optimizationto find their best solutions. And among them best solution found as global best.K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another. ColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]Search-Ant ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.Messaoudi mane[94]Bat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo Local output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with and simulat- ed annealingVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA. fitnerMaría-Luisa[98]Artificial py FA.	Vinita Jindal[91]	Ant Particle	Comparison based: Ant colony and PSO work separately
K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Dhanya[92]Search-Ant Colonyinput to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.Messaoudi Imane[94]Bat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo Local output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithmR.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and PSO Artificial anstand by FA.María-Luisa[98]Artificial firefliar		Optimization	to find their best solutions. And among them best solution
K. M.CrowRelay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as input to another.Dhanya[92]Search-Ant Colonyinput to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.Messaoudi Imane[94]Bat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo Search-Bat AlgorithmLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahim Berkan[97]Firefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefligerParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.			found as global best.
Dhanya[92]Search-Ant Colonyinput to another.Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.Messaoudi Imane[94]Bat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo Search-Bat AlgorithmLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- Recombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahim Berkan[97]Firefly and PSO Artificial ants and by FA.Condition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA.	K. M.	Crow	Relay-based technique: output of one algorithm assign as
ColonyColonyBoris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.Messaoudi Imane[94]Bat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo Search-Bat AlgorithmLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- Recombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahim Berkan[97]PSO PSO Artificial ants and by FA.Condition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA.	Dhanya[92]	Search-Ant	input to another.
Boris K. Lebe- dev[93]Ant and Bee ColonySwap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.Messaoudi Imane[94]Bat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckoo Search-Bat AlgorithmLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahim Berkan[97]Firefly and PSO Artificial ants and by FA.Condition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA.		Colony	
dev[93]ColonyMessaoudiBat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmMbSearch-Bat Algorithmalgorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and by FA.Parameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.	Boris K. Lebe-	Ant and Bee	Swap based: Ants and bees exchange their function.
Messaoudi Imane[94]Bat algo- rithmTabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo- rithm.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmMbSearch-Bat AlgorithmLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliaeParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.	dev[93]	Colony	
Imane[94]rithmrithm.MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithm to find global optimum solution.Saraswathi[95]Search-Bat Algorithmalgorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial firefliceParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and by FA.	Messaoudi	Bat algo-	Tabu search is used to select new solution in bat algo-
MbCuckooLocal output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat algorithmSaraswathi[95]Search-Bat Algorithmalgorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliaeParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.	Imane[94]	rithm	rithm.
Saraswathi[95]Search-Bat Algorithmalgorithm to find global optimum solution.R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefly aParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and firefly and	Mb	Cuckoo	Local output of Cuckoo search algorithm is assign to bat
R.Murugan[37]Algorithm Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial firefly and by FA.	Saraswathi[95]	Search-Bat	algorithm to find global optimum solution.
R.Murugan[37]Bat algo- rithm with ABCRecombination method: First phase is BA, the second is onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefly andParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.		Algorithm	
rithm with ABConlooker bee and the last is scout bee phaseVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and PSOCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliaeParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.	R.Murugan[37]	Bat algo-	Recombination method: First phase is BA, the second is
ABCVíctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly and PSOBerkan[97]PSOMaría-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliae		rithm with	onlooker bee and the last is scout bee phase
Víctor Yepes[96]Glow worm and simulat- ed annealingEvery glow worm movement is optimized by SAIbrahimFirefly and Berkan[97]Condition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled by FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliarParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.		ABC	
and simulat- ed annealingIbrahimFirefly andBerkan[97]PSOMaría-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliae	Víctor Yepes[96]	Glow worm	Every glow worm movement is optimized by SA
Ibrahimed annealingIbrahimFirefly andCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handledBerkan[97]PSOby FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]ArtificialParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tunedants andby FA.fireflicefireflice		and simulat-	
IbrahimFirefly andCondition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handledBerkan[97]PSOby FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliaeParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned		ed annealing	
Berkan[97]PSOby FA otherwise by PSO.María-Luisa[98]Artificial ants and firefliaeParameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned by FA.	Ibrahim	Firefly and	Condition based: If particle fitness is improve it is handled
María-Luisa[98] Artificial Parameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned ants and by FA.	Berkan[97]	PSO	by FA otherwise by PSO.
ants and by FA.	María-Luisa[98]	Artificial	Parameters Control: parameter of ant algorithm is tuned
fireflies		ants and	by FA.
memes		fireflies	
Alifia Puspan- Cuckoo Recombination method: First stage is cuckoo search,	Alifia Puspan-	Cuckoo	Recombination method: First stage is cuckoo search,
ingrum [99] Optimization Second stage is harmony search	ingrum [99]	Optimization	Second stage is harmony search
and HSA	-	and HSA	
Judhisthir Cuckoo New particle of PSO are produced by Lévy flight	Judhisthir	Cuckoo	New particle of PSO are produced by Lévy flight
Dash[61] Search PSO	Dash[61]	Search PSO	
S.V. Konstanti- GWO and Search process of Grey Wolf Optimizer and the Bees	S.V. Konstanti-	GWO and	Search process of Grey Wolf Optimizer and the Bees
nov [100] Bees Algo- Algorithm are combined.	nov [100]	Bees Algo-	Algorithm are combined.
rithm		rithm	

Table 12. Summary of Hybridization

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Hybridization
Wen Long[101]	GWO and	Cuckoo algorithm is used to generate new solution of wolf
	cuckoo	algorithm.
	search	
Ebenezer	GWO	Parameters Control: Parameters of GWO are optimized by
Daniel[102]	CINC 1	cuckoo search algorithm.
Prashant J.	GWO and	Information sharing strategy of bees is applied to wolf.
Gaidhane [103]	ABC	
Xinming	Biogeogra-	Single-dimensional and multi-dimensional strategy is used
Zhang[104]	phy-Based	to hybrid two algorithm
	Optimiza-	
	tion and	
Dahah AliIbra	GwU Grev Wolf	GWO local search is improved by DE operator
him[10]	Optimizer	Gwo local search is improved by DE operator
DagingWu[105]	DM-PSO-	Recombination method: First stage is dynamic multi
Daqing wa[105]	ABC	swarm PSO Second stage is CABC Third stage is PSO
	inde	global model.
Mustafa Servet	PSO- ABC	After recombination of PSO and ABC solution obtain is
Kiran[106]		given to PSO and ABC as the global best and neighbour
		food source for onlooker bees.
P. Amudha[107]	ABC-PSO	Cooperation strategy: One part of population process by
		PSO and other is by ABC. Further achievement of one part
		is shared with other.
Zichen	Cuckoo	Cooperation strategy: One group process by CS and other
Zhang[108]	search and	is DE. Both are combined to share individual information.
	differential	
	evolution	
Fadl Dahan[38]	Dynamic	3-Opt algorithm is hybridize with FACO to reduce the
	Flying Ant	chances of local minimum
	Colony	
	Optimiza-	
	tion	
Gulnur [71]	Bat Algo-	Modified Bat algorithm is hybrid with Differential Evolu-
0.1.101	rithm	tion Algorithm
QI LIU[08]	Bat algo-	BA has been hybridized with external optimization algo-
Mohammad[100]	rithm Island bat	IIIIIII The strategy of island model is adapted for bot incrimed
monanimed[109]	algorithm	algorithm
	argorithm	argorium

Imitating biological organism or physical system

New solution is generated by imitating the biological organism or physical system exhibit on the earth. This may include behavior, interaction or survival phenomena of living entity or any fix rule govern the physical system. In the following paragraph we present recent work done in the literature.

Table 13. Summary of Biological organism or Physical system

Year/Authors	Algorithm	Biological organism or Physical system
Krishn Kumar	Direction	Basic human qualities: Maturity, leader, awareness, fol-
Mishra[110]	Aware PSO	lower's relationship and leadership are combined with
	with Sensi-	PSO
	tive Swarm	
	Leader	
Yongquan	Symbiotic	Biological interaction: mutualism, commensalism and
Zhoua[111]	organism	parasitism phase
	search algo-	
	rithm	

New Topology

Different topology follows different rule and structure to solve problem. Property of topology can be used to find search solution with different perspective. This section present different topology used in swam intelligence for effective search result.

Year/Authors	Algorithm	New Topology
Noosheen Bak-	Cellular	Cellular automaton: Population is distributed to different
tash[112]	PSO-ABC	cell and best of solution obtain from each cell is exchange with other.
Wenping	ABC and	Von Neumann topology: Rectangular lattice topology is
Zou[113]	Von Neu-	used to share best solution with neighbours.
	mann topol-	-
	ogy	
Anping Lin[83]	PSO - ring	Ring topology
	topology	
Junkai Ji[114]	ABC with	Topology of scale free network
	scale-free	
	networks	
Chao Lu[115]	Cellular	Cellular automaton
	GWO	

Table 14. Summary of new topology

4 Current problems and future opportunities

In our study we find that balance between exploration and exploitation play major role in success of any swarm inspired algorithm. Many researchers proposed good solution but still there are challenging issue. Based on that we conclude some open problem and future direction.

Population generation

Swarm algorithms are more sensitive to generation of initial population. Small changes to initial population can change problem entirely. In literature most of the methods are surrounded to chaotic or opposition based learning. But in future new method should be developed based on new statically property, nonlinear distribution, numerical method, simulation technique which compatible with surrounding environment.

Population Update

In our finding population is updated based on data attribute, grouping, Selection scheme and EA operators. In future different attribute should be find out based on inherent property of data. Grouping may be combined with clustering for clear understanding of data. Selection scheme should be adaptive or automatic and data dependent and advanced EA operators can be applied.

Population Control

It is find out that most of the strategies are based on constant parameter update, in future automatic parameter tuning may be good domain to emerge.

Change in structure

It is found that in modification of governing equation most of formulations are based on formula borrow from other algorithm. It is recommended that in future other novel parameter, formula or step from biological system, physical law, chemical process, mathematical rule or any real life application should be applied.

Hybridization

It is prove that hybridization of different algorithm come with new opportunities. It is recommended that recent developed algorithm in swarm intelligence should be learned and based on its property other compatible algorithm should be combine.

New Topology

In literature few researcher try to developed algorithm structure with new topology. This is still active research area. New topological structure from other domain should be investigated and applied to swarm algorithms.

References

- Zhou F, Yang Y (2015) An Improved Artificial Bee Colony Algorithm Based on Particle Swarm Optimization and Differential Evolution. In: Huang D-S, Jo K-H, Hussain A (eds) Intelligent Computing Theories and Methodologies. Springer International Publishing, Cham, pp 24–35
- Verma OP, Aggarwal D, Patodi T (2016) Opposition and dimensional based modified firefly algorithm. Expert Syst Appl 44:168–176. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.eswa.2015.08.054
- Guha D, Roy PK, Banerjee S (2016) Load frequency control of large scale power system using quasi-oppositional grey wolf optimization algorithm. Eng Sci Technol an Int J 19:1693–1713. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jestch.2016.07.004

- kumar Y, Sahoo G (2017) A two-step artificial bee colony algorithm for clustering. Neural Comput Appl 28:537–551. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00521-015-2095-5
- Moradi P, Imanian N, Qader NN, Jalili M (2018) Improving exploration property of velocity-based artificial bee colony algorithm using chaotic systems. Inf Sci (Ny) 465:130–143. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ins.2018.06.064
- Tian D, Shi Z (2018) MPSO: Modified particle swarm optimization and its applications. Swarm Evol Comput 41:49–68. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j .swevo.2018.01.011
- Chun-Feng W, Kui L, Pei-Ping S (2014) Hybrid Artificial Bee Colony Algorithm and Particle Swarm Search for Global Optimization. Math Probl Eng 2014:832949. https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/832949
- Heidari AA, Abbaspour RA, Chen H (2019) Efficient boosted grey wolf optimizers for global search and kernel extreme learning machine training. Appl Soft Comput 81:105521. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2019.105521
- Zhou Z, Zhang R, Wang Y, et al (2018) Color difference classification based on optimization support vector machine of improved grey wolf algorithm. Optik (Stuttg) 170:17–29. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijleo.2018.05.096
- Ibrahim RA, Elaziz MA, Lu S (2018) Chaotic opposition-based grey-wolf optimization algorithm based on differential evolution and disruption operator for global optimization. Expert Syst Appl 108:1–27. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016 /j.eswa.2018.04.028
- Liu X, Tian Y, Lei X, et al (2019) An improved self-adaptive grey wolf optimizer for the daily optimal operation of cascade pumping stations. Appl Soft Comput 75:473– 493. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.11.039
- 12. Deng C (2015) A Novel Hybrid Data Clustering Algorithm Based on Artificial Bee Colony Algorithm and *K*-Means. Chinese J Electron 24:694-701(7)
- Gan C, Cao W, Wu M, Chen X (2018) A new bat algorithm based on iterative local search and stochastic inertia weight. Expert Syst Appl 104:202–212. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2018.03.015
- Cai Z, Gu J, Luo J, et al (2019) Evolving an optimal kernel extreme learning machine by using an enhanced grey wolf optimization strategy. Expert Syst Appl 138:112814. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2019.07.031
- Zhou Y, Chen X, Zhou G (2016) An improved monkey algorithm for a 0-1 knapsack problem. Appl Soft Comput 38:817–830. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.asoc.2015.10.043
- 16. Tu Q, Chen X, Liu X (2019) Multi-strategy ensemble grey wolf optimizer and its application to feature selection. Appl Soft Comput 76:16–30. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.11.047
- Kumar V, Kumar D (2017) An astrophysics-inspired Grey wolf algorithm for numerical optimization and its application to engineering design problems. Adv Eng Softw 112:231–254. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.advengsoft.2017.05.008
- Long W, Jiao J, Liang X, Tang M (2018) Inspired grey wolf optimizer for solving large-scale function optimization problems. Appl Math Model 60:112–126. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2018.03.005
- 19. Mishra KK, Bisht H, Singh T, Chang V (2018) A Direction Aware Particle Swarm

Optimization with Sensitive Swarm Leader. Big Data Res 14:57–67. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bdr.2018.03.001

- 20. Lin A, Sun W, Yu H, et al (2019) Adaptive comprehensive learning particle swarm optimization with cooperative archive. Appl Soft Comput 77:533–546. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2019.01.047
- Saad E, Elhosseini MA, Haikal AY (2019) Culture-based Artificial Bee Colony with heritage mechanism for optimization of Wireless Sensors Network. Appl Soft Comput 79:59–73. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2019.03.040
- Banati H, Chaudhary R (2017) Multi-Modal Bat Algorithm with Improved Search (MMBAIS). J Comput Sci 23:130–144. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016 /j.jocs.2016.12.003
- Eskandari L, Jafarian A, Rahimloo P, Baleanu D (2019) A Modified and Enhanced Ant Colony Optimization Algorithm for Traveling Salesman Problem: Theoretical Aspects. pp 257–265
- 24. Awadallah MA, Al-Betar MA, Bolaji AL, et al (2019) Natural selection methods for artificial bee colony with new versions of onlooker bee. Soft Comput 23:6455–6494. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00500-018-3299-2
- Aslan S (2019) A Transition Control Mechanism for Artificial Bee Colony (ABC) Algorithm. Comput Intell Neurosci 2019:5012313. https://doi.org/10.1155 /2019/5012313
- Wang H-J, Fu Y, Zhao Z-Q, Yue Y-J (2019) An Improved Ant Colony Algorithm of Robot Path Planning for Obstacle Avoidance. J Robot 2019:6097591. https://doi.org/10.1155/2019/6097591
- Ariyaratne MKA, Fernando TGI, Weerakoon S (2019) Solving systems of nonlinear equations using a modified firefly algorithm (MODFA). Swarm Evol Comput 48:72– 92. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2019.03.010
- Zhang L, Srisukkham W, Neoh SC, et al (2018) Classifier ensemble reduction using a modified firefly algorithm: An empirical evaluation. Expert Syst Appl 93:395–422. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2017.10.001
- Wang L, Zhong Y, Yin Y (2016) Nearest neighbour cuckoo search algorithm with probabilistic mutation. Appl Soft Comput 49:498–509. https://doi.org/https://doi.org /10.1016/j.asoc.2016.08.021
- Abiyev RH, Tunay M (2016) Experimental Study of Specific Benchmarking Functions for Modified Monkey Algorithm. Procedia Comput Sci 102:595–602. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2016.09.448
- Pradhan M, Roy PK, Pal T (2018) Oppositional based grey wolf optimization algorithm for economic dispatch problem of power system. Ain Shams Eng J 9:2015– 2025. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asej.2016.08.023
- 32. Xie H, Zhang L, Lim CP, et al (2019) Improving K-means clustering with enhanced Firefly Algorithms. Appl Soft Comput 84:105763. https://doi.org/ https://doi.org /10.1016/j.asoc.2019.105763
- He M, Liu M, Wang R, et al (2019) Particle swarm optimization with damping factor and cooperative mechanism. Appl Soft Comput 76:45–52. https://doi.org/https: //doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.11.050
- 34. Long W, Jiao J, Liang X, Tang M (2018) An exploration-enhanced grey wolf

optimizer to solve high-dimensional numerical optimization. Eng Appl Artif Intell 68:63–80. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.engappai.2017.10.024

- 35. Salgotra R, Singh U, Saha S (2018) New cuckoo search algorithms with enhanced exploration and exploitation properties. Expert Syst Appl 95:384–420. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2017.11.044
- Sharma M, Chhabra JK (2019) Sustainable automatic data clustering using hybrid PSO algorithm with mutation. Sustain Comput Informatics Syst 23:144–157. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.suscom.2019.07.009
- 37. Murugan R, Mohan MR, Rajan CCA, et al (2018) Hybridizing bat algorithm with artificial bee colony for combined heat and power economic dispatch. Appl Soft Comput 72:189–217. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.06.034
- Dahan F, Hindi K, Mathkour, AlSalman (2019) Dynamic Flying Ant Colony Optimization (DFACO) for Solving the Traveling Salesman Problem. Sensors 19:1837. https://doi.org/10.3390/s19081837
- Banerjee A, Ghosh D, Das S (2018) Modified firefly algorithm for area estimation and tracking of fast expanding oil spills. Appl Soft Comput 73:829–847. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.09.024
- Dhabal S, Venkateswaran P (2017) An efficient gbest-guided Cuckoo Search algorithm for higher order two channel filter bank design. Swarm Evol Comput 33:68– 84. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2016.10.003
- Tian M, Bo Y, Chen Z, et al (2019) A new improved firefly clustering algorithm for SMC-PHD filter. Appl Soft Comput 85:105840. https://doi.org/ https://doi.org /10.1016/j.asoc.2019.105840
- 42. Kumar D, Mishra KK (2018) Co-variance guided Artificial Bee Colony. Appl Soft Comput 70:86–107. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.04.050
- 43. Cui L, Li G, Luo Y, et al (2018) An enhanced artificial bee colony algorithm with dual-population framework. Swarm Evol Comput 43:184–206. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2018.05.002
- 44. Zhou J, Yao X, Chan FTS, et al (2019) An individual dependent multi-colony artificial bee colony algorithm. Inf Sci (Ny) 485:114–140. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ins.2019.02.014
- 45. Sharma A, Sharma A, Panigrahi BK, et al (2016) Ageist Spider Monkey Optimization algorithm. Swarm Evol Comput 28:58–77. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2016.01.002
- 46. ÖZKIŞ A, Babalik A (2014) Performance Comparision of ABC and A-ABC Algorithms on Clustering Problems. In: Proceedings of the International Conference on Machine Vision and Machine Learning, Prague, Czech Republic
- Zhang C, Ouyang D, Ning J (2010) An artificial bee colony approach for clustering. Expert Syst Appl 37:4761–4767. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j. eswa .2009.11.003
- Biswas S, Bose D, Kundu S (2012) A Clustering Particle Based Artificial Bee Colony Algorithm for Dynamic Environment. In: Panigrahi BK, Das S, Suganthan PN, Nanda PK (eds) Swarm, Evolutionary, and Memetic Computing. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, Berlin, Heidelberg, pp 151–159
- 49. Li X, Yu D (2019) Study on an Optimal Path Planning for a Robot Based on an

Improved ANT Colony Algorithm. Autom Control Comput Sci 53:236–243. https://doi.org/10.3103/S0146411619030064

- 50. Al-Betar MA, Awadallah MA, Faris H, et al (2018) Bat-inspired algorithms with natural selection mechanisms for global optimization. Neurocomputing 273:448–465. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neucom.2017.07.039
- 51. Wu B, Qian C, Ni W, Fan S (2012) The improvement of glowworm swarm optimization for continuous optimization problems. Expert Syst Appl 39:6335–6342. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2011.12.017
- Kamoona AM, Patra JC (2019) A novel enhanced cuckoo search algorithm for contrast enhancement of gray scale images. Appl Soft Comput 85:105749. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2019.105749
- 53. Tian D, Zhao X, Shi Z (2019) Chaotic particle swarm optimization with sigmoidbased acceleration coefficients for numerical function optimization. Swarm Evol Comput 51:100573. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2019.100573
- Liu G, Chen W, Chen H, Xie J (2019) A Quantum Particle Swarm Optimization Algorithm with Teamwork Evolutionary Strategy. Math Probl Eng 2019:1805198. https://doi.org/10.1155/2019/1805198
- 55. Yan X, Zhu Y, Zou W, Wang L (2012) A new approach for data clustering using hybrid artificial bee colony algorithm. Neurocomputing 97:241–250. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neucom.2012.04.025
- Sharma M, Chhabra JK (2019) An efficient hybrid PSO polygamous crossover based clustering algorithm. Evol Intell. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12065-019-00235-4
- 57. Xia Y, Feng Z, Niu W, et al (2019) Simplex quantum-behaved particle swarm optimization algorithm with application to ecological operation of cascade hydropower reservoirs. Appl Soft Comput 84:105715. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016 /j.asoc.2019.105715
- Sharifipour H, Shakeri M, Haghighi H (2018) Structural test data generation using a memetic ant colony optimization based on evolution strategies. Swarm Evol Comput 40:76–91. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2017.12.009
- Lyu S, Li Z, Huang Y, et al (2019) Improved self-adaptive bat algorithm with stepcontrol and mutation mechanisms. J Comput Sci 30:65–78. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.jocs.2018.11.002
- 60. Altabeeb AM, Mohsen AM, Ghallab A (2019) An improved hybrid firefly algorithm for capacitated vehicle routing problem. Appl Soft Comput 84:105728. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2019.105728
- Dash J, Dam B, Swain R (2017) Optimal design of linear phase multi-band stop filters using improved cuckoo search particle swarm optimization. Appl Soft Comput 52:435–445. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2016.10.024
- 62. Cao M, Yang Y, Wang L (2019) Application of Improved Ant Colony Algorithm in the Path Planning Problem of Mobile Robot. In: Proceedings of the 2019 3rd High Performance Computing and Cluster Technologies Conference. Association for Computing Machinery, New York, NY, USA, pp 11–15
- Choong SS, Wong L-P, Lim CP (2019) An artificial bee colony algorithm with a Modified Choice Function for the traveling salesman problem. Swarm Evol Comput 44:622–635. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2018.08.004

- Saxena A, Soni BP, Kumar R, Gupta V (2018) Intelligent Grey Wolf Optimizer Development and application for strategic bidding in uniform price spot energy market. Appl Soft Comput 69:1–13. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc .2018.04.018
- 65. Yang B, Miao J, Fan Z, et al (2018) Modified cuckoo search algorithm for the optimal placement of actuators problem. Appl Soft Comput 67:48–60. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.03.004
- 66. Rakhshani H, Rahati A (2017) Snap-drift cuckoo search: A novel cuckoo search optimization algorithm. Appl Soft Comput 52:771–794. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2016.09.048
- Akhand MAH, Ayon SI, Shahriyar SA, et al (2020) Discrete Spider Monkey Optimization for Travelling Salesman Problem. Appl Soft Comput 86:105887. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ASOC.2019.105887
- Liu Q, Wu L, Xiao W, et al (2018) A novel hybrid bat algorithm for solving continuous optimization problems. Appl Soft Comput 73:67–82. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.08.012
- Ramli MR, Abas ZA, Desa MI, et al (2019) Enhanced convergence of Bat Algorithm based on dimensional and inertia weight factor. J King Saud Univ - Comput Inf Sci 31:452–458. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jksuci.2018.03.010
- Luo K (2019) Enhanced grey wolf optimizer with a model for dynamically estimating the location of the prey. Appl Soft Comput 77:225–235. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2019.01.025
- Yildizdan G, Baykan ÖK (2020) A novel modified bat algorithm hybridizing by differential evolution algorithm. Expert Syst Appl 141:112949. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2019.112949
- 72. Kumar S, Sharma B, Sharma VK, et al (2018) Plant leaf disease identification using exponential spider monkey optimization. Sustain Comput Informatics Syst. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.suscom.2018.10.004
- 73. Sarangi SK, Panda R, Das PK, Abraham A (2018) Design of optimal high pass and band stop FIR filters using adaptive Cuckoo search algorithm. Eng Appl Artif Intell 70:67–80. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.engappai.2018.01.005
- 74. Naik MK, Panda R (2016) A novel adaptive cuckoo search algorithm for intrinsic discriminant analysis based face recognition. Appl Soft Comput 38:661–675. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2015.10.039
- 75. Gupta S, Deep K (2019) A novel Random Walk Grey Wolf Optimizer. Swarm Evol Comput 44:101–112. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2018.01.001
- 76. Zhu G, Kwong S (2010) Gbest-guided artificial bee colony algorithm for numerical function optimization. Appl Math Comput 217:3166–3173. https://doi.org/https: //doi.org/10.1016/j.amc.2010.08.049
- 77. Sharma TK, Pant M, Abraham A (2013) Blend of local and global variant of PSO in ABC. In: 2013 World Congress on Nature and Biologically Inspired Computing. pp 113–119
- Imanian N, Shiri ME, Moradi P (2014) Velocity based artificial bee colony algorithm for high dimensional continuous optimization problems. Eng Appl Artif Intell 36:148– 163. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.engappai.2014.07.012

- 79. Zakaria N. Alqattan RA (2015) A hybrid artificial bee colony algorithm for numerical function optimization. Int J Mod Phys 26:
- Chen X, Wei X, Yang G, Du W (2020) Fireworks explosion based artificial bee colony for numerical optimization. Knowledge-Based Syst 188:105002. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.knosys.2019.105002
- Yelghi A, Köse C (2018) A modified firefly algorithm for global minimum optimization. Appl Soft Comput 62:29–44. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/ j.asoc.2017.10.032
- Singh PR, Elaziz MA, Xiong S (2018) Modified Spider Monkey Optimization based on Nelder–Mead method for global optimization. Expert Syst Appl 110:264–289. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2018.05.040
- Lin A, Sun W, Yu H, et al (2019) Global genetic learning particle swarm optimization with diversity enhancement by ring topology. Swarm Evol Comput 44:571–583. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2018.07.002
- 84. El-Abd M (2012) On the Hybridization of the Artificial Bee Colony and Particle Swarm Optimization Algorithms. J Artif Intell Soft Comput Res 2:
- Baktash N and MMR (2011) A New Hybridized Approach of PSO and ABC Algorithm for Optimization. In: Proceedings of the 2011 International Conference on Measurement and Control Engineering. pp 309–313
- 86. Oğuz Altun TK Particle Swarm Optimization. In: Scientific Cooperations International Workshops on Electrical and Computer Engineering
- Vitorino LN, Ribeiro SF, Bastos-Filho CJA (2015) A mechanism based on Artificial Bee Colony to generate diversity in Particle Swarm Optimization. Neurocomputing 148:39–45. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neucom.2013.03.076
- Li Z, Wang W, Yan Y, Li Z (2015) PS–ABC: A hybrid algorithm based on particle swarm and artificial bee colony for high-dimensional optimization problems. Expert Syst Appl 42:8881–8895. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2015.07.043
- Bouyer A, Hatamlou A (2018) An efficient hybrid clustering method based on improved cuckoo optimization and modified particle swarm optimization algorithms. Appl Soft Comput 67:172–182. https://doi.org/ https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc. 2018.03.011
- 90. Goel R, Maini R (2018) A hybrid of ant colony and firefly algorithms (HAFA) for solving vehicle routing problems. J Comput Sci 25:28–37. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jocs.2017.12.012
- 91. Jindal V, Bedi P (2018) An improved hybrid ant particle optimization (IHAPO) algorithm for reducing travel time in VANETs. Appl Soft Comput 64:526–535. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2017.12.038
- 92. Dhanya KM, Kanmani S, Hanitha G, Abirami S (2018) Hybrid Crow Search-Ant Colony Optimization Algorithm for Capacitated Vehicle Routing Problem. In: Zelinka I, Senkerik R, Panda G, Lekshmi Kanthan PS (eds) Soft Computing Systems. Springer Singapore, Singapore, pp 46–52
- 93. Lebedev B, Lebedev O, Lebedeva E, Kostyuk A (2019) Integration of Models of Adaptive Behavior of Ant and Bee Colony. pp 174–185
- 94. Imane M, Nadjet K (2016) Hybrid Bat algorithm for overlapping community detection. IFAC-PapersOnLine 49:1454–1459. https://doi.org/ https://doi.org/10.1016/

j.ifacol.2016.07.776

- Saraswathi M, Murali GB, Deepak BBVL (2018) Optimal Path Planning of Mobile Robot Using Hybrid Cuckoo Search-Bat Algorithm. Procedia Comput Sci 133:510– 517. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2018.07.064
- 96. Yepes V, Martí J V, García-Segura T (2015) Cost and CO2 emission optimization of precast–prestressed concrete U-beam road bridges by a hybrid glowworm swarm algorithm. Autom Constr 49:123–134. https://doi.org/https://doi.org /10.1016/j.autcon. 2014.10.013
- 97. Aydilek İB (2018) A hybrid firefly and particle swarm optimization algorithm for computationally expensive numerical problems. Appl Soft Comput 66:232–249. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.02.025
- 98. Pérez-Delgado M-L (2018) Artificial ants and fireflies can perform colour quantisation. Appl Soft Comput 73:153–177. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.08.018
- Puspaningrum A, Sarno R (2017) A Hybrid Cuckoo Optimization and Harmony Search Algorithm for Software Cost Estimation. Procedia Comput Sci 124:461–469. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2017.12.178
- 100. Konstantinov S V, Khamidova UK, Sofronova EA (2019) A Novel Hybrid Method of Global Optimization Based on the Grey Wolf Optimizer and the Bees Algorithm. Procedia Comput Sci 150:471–477. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.procs. 2019.02.081
- 101.
 Long W, Cai S, Jiao J, et al (2020) A new hybrid algorithm based on grey wolf optimizer and cuckoo search for parameter extraction of solar photovoltaic models. Energy Convers Manag 203:112243. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enconman.2019.112243
- 102. Daniel E, Anitha J, Gnanaraj J (2017) Optimum laplacian wavelet mask based medical image using hybrid cuckoo search – grey wolf optimization algorithm. Knowledge-Based Syst 131:58–69. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.knosys.2017.05.017
- Gaidhane PJ, Nigam MJ (2018) A hybrid grey wolf optimizer and artificial bee colony algorithm for enhancing the performance of complex systems. J Comput Sci 27:284– 302. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jocs.2018.06.008
- 104. Zhang X, Kang Q, Cheng J, Wang X (2018) A novel hybrid algorithm based on Biogeography-Based Optimization and Grey Wolf Optimizer. Appl Soft Comput 67:197–214. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2018.02.049
- 105. Wu D, Zheng J (2012) A Dynamic Multistage Hybrid Swarm Intelligence Optimization Algorithm for Function Optimization. Discret Dyn Nat Soc 2012:578064. https://doi.org/10.1155/2012/578064
- 106. Kıran MS, Gündüz M (2013) A recombination-based hybridization of particle swarm optimization and artificial bee colony algorithm for continuous optimization problems. Appl Soft Comput 13:2188–2203. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc. 2012.12.007
- 107. Amudha P, Karthik S, Sivakumari S (2015) A Hybrid Swarm Intelligence Algorithm for Intrusion Detection Using Significant Features. Sci World J 2015:574589. https://doi.org/10.1155/2015/574589
- 108. Zhang Z, Ding S, Jia W (2019) A hybrid optimization algorithm based on cuckoo

search and differential evolution for solving constrained engineering problems. Eng Appl Artif Intell 85:254–268. https://doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.engappai. 2019.06.017

- 109. Al-Betar MA, Awadallah MA (2018) Island bat algorithm for optimization. Expert Syst Appl 107:126–145. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2018.04.024
- Cheng R, Jin Y (2015) A social learning particle swarm optimization algorithm for scalable optimization. Inf Sci (Ny) 291:43–60. https://doi.org/ https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.ins.2014.08.039
- 111. Zhou Y, Wu H, Luo Q, Abdel-Baset M (2019) Automatic data clustering using natureinspired symbiotic organism search algorithm. Knowledge-Based Syst 163:546–557. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.knosys.2018.09.013
- 112. Baktash N, Mahmoudi F, Meybodi M (2012) Cellular PSO-ABC: A New Hybrid Model for Dynamic Environment. Int J Comput Theory Eng 4:365–368. https://doi.org/10.7763/IJCTE.2012.V4.485
- 113. Zou W, Zhu Y, Chen H, Ku T (2011) Clustering approach based on von neumann topology artificial bee colony algorithm. In: Proceedings of the International Conference on Data Mining (DMIN). The Steering Committee of The World Congress in Computer Science, Computer ..., p 1
- 114. Ji J, Song S, Tang C, et al (2019) An artificial bee colony algorithm search guided by scale-free networks. Inf Sci (Ny) 473:142–165. https://doi.org/https: //doi.org/ 10.1016/j.ins.2018.09.034
- 115. Lu C, Gao L, Yi J (2018) Grey wolf optimizer with cellular topological structure. Expert Syst Appl 107:89–114. https:// doi.org/https:// doi.org/10.1016/j. eswa. 2018.04.012